

Measuring the Benefits of Community Forestry

BCCFA Indicators Project

Introduction

The BC Community Forest Association (BCCFA) has collaborated with the Ministry of Forests, Lands and Natural Resource Operations and a number of independent advisors to develop a system to measure and track the benefits of community forests. The results will be of great value to the BCCFA, to individual community forests, to the Province of British Columbia, and to the public. Individual community forests will use a common set of indicators to collect data specific to their operations. The data will be reported to and compiled annually by the BCCFA.

Focus of the Project

Over the course of the past year, we have worked with an Advisory Group to identify the most compelling indicators that demonstrate the tangible social, cultural, economic and environmental

benefits that community forests bring to their communities and to the province. We have sought out the most common, universal and easy to measure indicators that can be applied regardless of governance structure or ecosystem to show the provincial impact of CFAs. It is understood that data collection must be easy and inexpensive.

Indicators must be:

- Measurable
- Credible
- Engaging

Objectives

Every community forest is unique and they all strive to meet the needs of their communities. While each may have a different focus, collectively their efforts support the Provincial Government's objectives. Through the course of this project we have focused on the most common objectives shared by all. Eighteen indicators will measure progress towards the following **four key objectives**:

- A. Community forests provide economic benefits to their communities and to British Columbia.
- B. Community forests provide social benefits to their communities and to the province; they promote community involvement and participation, and forest worker safety.
- C. Community forests promote communication and strengthen relationships between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal communities and persons.
- D. Community forest management is consistent with sound principles of environmental stewardship that reflect a broad spectrum of values.

Objective A: Community forests provide economic benefits to their communities and to the province of British Columbia.

This is measured by:

- 1. The number of jobs the community forest creates
- 2. The total economic activity generated by the community forest
- 3. The cash and in-kind contributions made by the community forest
- 4. The additional funds leveraged by those contributions
- 5. The active role the community forests play in the forest sector through harvesting
- 6. The support for the full spectrum of milling and manufacturing facilities
- 7. Investments in the future economic return of the forest through intensive silviculture
- 8. Efforts to diversify the economic activities of the community forest.

Objective B: Community forests provide social benefits to their communities and to the province; they promote community involvement and participation, and forest worker safety. This is measured by:

- 9. The accountability of the community forest agreement holder to the local community
- 10. The range and depth of engagement with different sectors of the community
- 11. Investments in education
- 12. Investments in recreation
- 13. Proactive efforts to reduce the wildfire hazard to communities
- 14. Forest worker safety.

Objective C: Community forestry promotes communication and strengthens relationships between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal communities and persons.

This is measured by:

15. The breadth and depth of First Nation involvement in community forests.

Objective D: Community forestry is consistent with sound principles of environmental stewardship that reflect a broad spectrum of values.

This is measured by:

- 16. The management of sensitive areas
- 17. Investments in forest stewardship incremental to legal requirements
- 18. Compliance with environmental standards.

Indicators will compliment Community Forest Stories

There is consensus that coming up with a set of common indicators will help the BCCFA and our members promote community forestry, and will support government decision-makers to expand and improve the program. That being said, it is also very important to continue to collect stories of the ways in which individual community forests are benefiting their communities. Stories are the heart of who we are and what we do. This qualitative information will continue to be of great importance. In addition, reporting on the provincial objectives for the program and on each CFA's commitments is likely to require this qualitative information. Indicators are a complimentary methodology to the narrative story telling.

Target Setting

The first survey of community forests will generate data on the current status of community forestry across the province. With this information in hand, consideration will be given to creating a forecast for each indicator, as well as to setting a target for each. By forecasting, setting targets and committing to the principle of Continuous Improvement community forests can work with the Province, Public and Industry to meet objectives as they change through time.

Indicator #1: Number of Jobs

Indicator Linkage to Objectives:

A. Community forests provide economic benefits to their communities and to the province of

British Columbia

Rationale

This indicator will measure both the number of jobs per year & the number of jobs per cubic metre.

Local employment in rural communities is one of the primary benefits of community forests. This indicator measures the total direct employment & contract labour generated by the community forest.

Further, the number of jobs/m3 shows the value, in terms of employment, of the harvest volume

allocated to community forests.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

1. The total # of hours of direct employment and contracts with the community forest during the

reporting year.

2. The approximate number of individual people who DIRECTLY come in contact with CFA wood or tenure and derive some or all of their annual income as a direct result of the community forest

harvest.

3. The # of m3 harvested in the reporting year

4. Allowable Annual Cut

Instructions

Total hours reported will include hours of direct employment and contracted employment and subsidized employment. This includes administration staff, operations, etc. It may be necessary for

community forest managers to ask their contractors to provide estimates.

Calculations & Analysis

One "Full Time Equivalent" (FTE) is equal to 1820 hours per year. By members reporting on the number

of hours, the BCCFA will be able to tally the results and derive the figures to be reported.

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Measurement Interval: Annual

Indicator #2: Total Economic Activity

Indicator Linkage to Objectives:

A. Community forests provide economic benefits to their communities and to the province of British Columbia

Rationale

As long-term area-based tenures, community forests support long-term community economic development resulting in more self-reliant rural communities. The total annual cost of sales and expenditures is an indicator of the total economic activity generated by the community forest.

Methodology

Survey respondents report:

1. The total value (\$) of sales and expenditures in the last year.

Instructions

Value of sales and expenditures should be available on the annual income statement of the community forest. This figure represents total operating expenses and includes fixed and production costs.

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Indicator #4: Community Contributions

Indicator Linkage to Objectives:

A. Community forests provide economic benefits to their communities and to the province of

British Columbia

B. Community forests provide social benefits to their communities and to the province; they

promote community involvement and participation, and forest worker safety.

Rationale

The cash and in-kind contributions made by the community forest are an important indicator of the distribution of economic benefits locally. In many cases, these contributions serve social objectives, in

addition to economic ones.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

1. The total cash contributed to the community through grants, infrastructure improvements,

special projects etc. in the past year.

2. The total in-kind contributions to the community measured in dollars.

Instructions

Respondents to tally the total cash contributions on an annual basis, and separately, the total in kind

contributions, estimated in dollars.

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Measurement Interval: annual

Indicator #4: Funds Leveraged by the Community Forest

Indicator Linkage to Objectives:

A. Community forests provide economic benefits to their communities and to the province of

British Columbia

B. Community forests provide social benefits to their communities and to the province; they

promote community involvement and participation, and forest worker safety.

Rationale

In many cases, the profits generated and contributions made by community forests are used as seed

money to grow larger projects and generate even more local benefits. This indicator will show how CFA funds are used to leverage additional funds for community priorities. As with Indicator #3, often these

projects serve social objectives, in addition to economic ones.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

1. The total dollars raised from outside sources for local projects, leveraged by CFA profits.

Instructions

Respondents to tally the total dollars raised from outside sources for local projects, leveraged by CFA

profits.

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Measurement Interval: Annual

Indicator #5: Cut Control

Indicator Linkage to Objectives:

A. Community forests provide economic benefits to their communities and to the province of British Columbia

Rationale

Community forests play an active role in the forest sector through harvesting. This indicator will measure their success at meeting cut control requirements, keeping the supply of logs flowing.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

- 1. The total cubic metres of undercut in the last cut control period.
- 2. Whether they are on target to meet their cut in the current period.
- 3. Relevant comments. If you are operating in your first cut control period, please let us know in this comment section

Instructions

- 1. Respondents will provide the total volume available for harvest in the cut control period.
- 2. Provide the total cubic metres of undercut in the last cut control period.
- 3. Whether they are on target to meet their cut in the current period: Yes/NO
- 4. Give any relevant comments or rationale that explains the answers provided.

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Indicator #6: Distribution of Log Sales

Indicator Linkage to Objectives:

A. Community forests provide economic benefits to their communities and to the province of British Columbia

Rationale

Community forests supply wood on the open market to major industry, and also to small and medium sized mills and value added manufacturers. In doing so, they strive to support the full spectrum of milling and manufacturing facilities. As was demonstrated in the data collected on CFA log sales for the Working Roundtable on Forestry, approximately 70% of the community forest harvest is sold to major processing facilities. This indicator will provide updated information on the distribution of log sales that can be tracked over time.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

The volume of sales to each of the following categories, based on the annual log input of a mill/manufacturing facility:

- Large > 200,000 m3/yr
- Medium 50,000 to 200,000 m3/yr
- Small < 50,000 m3/yr
- Value Added: specialty project manufacturing facilities such as flooring, log homes, soundboards etc.
- Facility that utilizes low quality fibre (bio-energy, pellet plants etc)
- Other: Please describe

Instructions

To assist respondents in answering this question, upon request the BCCFA will provide scale site data, provided by MFLRNO.

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported.

Indicator Monitoring Plan

A. Community forests provide economic benefits to their communities and to the province of British Columbia

Rationale

As long-term, area-based tenures, community forest agreements create strong incentives for investment in the future. This indicator will measure investments in the future economic return of the forest. By measuring the investments in intensive silviculture, incremental to legal requirements, it will demonstrate efforts to increase the growing capacity in community forest, with the intent of increasing the AAC.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

- The total value, in dollars, of the community forest's investment of their own money and money from outside sources in intensive silviculture, incremental to legal requirements. Activities include: spacing, brushing, enhanced genetic stock, quick regeneration. Respondents will report the total treatment cost, including planning, development, and administration of these projects.
- 2. The number of hectares treated.
- 3. The number of hectares treated to date.
- 4. Brief description of the incremental activities.

Instructions

Respondents will report separately on work paid for by the community forest, and work paid for with outside sources (like Land Based Investment Program: Forests For Tomorrow)

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported.

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Indicator #8: Economic Diversification

Indicator Linkage to Objectives:

A. Community forests provide economic benefits to their communities and to the province of

British Columbia

Rationale

One of the provincial objectives for the community forest program is to diversify the use of and benefits derived from the community forest agreement area. The CFA tenure is one of only two forest tenures in

BC that has the right to develop and manage Non Timber Forest Resources (NTFRs). Section 43.3 of the

Community Forest Legislation through the Forest Act gives rights to harvest and collect fees for NTFRs.

The indicator will show the degree to which community forests are generating revenue from sources other than timber. These include botanical forest products and other prescribed products (such as

carbon credits) as listed in Schedule C of the Community Forest Agreement Licence. While little

development has occurred in this realm to date, this indicator will provide baseline data.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

The total value in dollars of revenue from diversified sales for the reporting period.

Instructions

Report the total value in dollars of revenue from diversified sales for the reporting period including all

products for which the CFA holder has the authority to manage according to Schedule C of the

Agreement.

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported.

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Measurement Interval: Annual

B. Community forests provide social benefits to their communities and to the province; they promote community involvement and participation and forest worker safety.

Rationale

One of the elements of community forests that set them apart from other forest tenures is their accountability to their local communities. This accountability is the cornerstone of local decision-making. In community forestry, management decisions are made by those who have to live with them. Furthermore, when local people have a hand in management of the forests adjacent to their rural communities, they are more likely to be innovative in the integration of multiple values in their decision-making. This indicator measures whether the community forest reports out annually to its community on its progress towards objectives as identified in the Community Forest Agreement Management Plan.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

- 1. Annual reporting to the community on the commitments made in the Community Forest Agreement Management Plan. Yes/No
- 2. Select from a list, all of the various strategies they employ to share information and report to the local community.

Instructions

- 1. Answer Yes/No to annual reporting to the community.
- 2. The survey will provide a list of potential strategies & tools used to communicate the community forest's performance on the commitments made in the Management plan. Tick all that apply.

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported.

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Indicator #10: Public Engagement

Indicator Linkage to Objectives:

B. Community forests provide social benefits to their communities and to the province; they

promote community involvement and participation and forest worker safety.

Rationale

While Indicator #9 focuses on reporting out to the community, this indicator measures the efforts of the community forest to engage with the diversity of community members. Outreach to the full array of forest users and community members leads to an improved awareness of forest management among

members of the public, and increases potential to resolve conflicts over timber harvesting in watersheds

and other sensitive areas.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

1. The community sectors that the community forest engages in targeted outreach and

consultation activities.

2. The number of formal agreements with community organizations and user groups.

Instructions

Select from the list the community sectors that the community forest engages in targeted outreach and consultation activities: water users, property owners, tourism associations, chamber of commerce,

environmental groups, hunters, firewood cutters, ranchers, miners, trappers, mountain bike groups,

hiking groups, motorized vehicle recreation groups, horseback riding groups, cross country ski etc.

Report the total number of formal agreements with these groups.

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported.

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Measurement Interval: Annual

Indicator #11: Investments in Community Education

Indicator Linkage to Objectives:

B. Community forests provide social benefits to their communities and to the province; they

promote community involvement and participation and forest worker safety.

Rationale

Community forests provide an opportunity to link community members to the forest, and to increase their understanding of forest ecosystems and management. As long-term, area-based tenures, community forests provide enhanced opportunities for education and research. Community forests can be laboratories for testing innovative forest practices. This indicator measures the investments the

community forest is making in education and capacity building.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

1. Number of hours spent on coordination and delivering educational activities in the community

2. The total value, in dollars, of all community forest investments in education.

Instructions

Respondents will include the time spent by community forest staff, contractors, employees and volunteers on all educational activities. This includes school presentations, field trips, public events, as well as training supported by the community forest (such as first aid, faller certification, etc.).

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported.

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Measurement Interval: Annual

Indicator #12: Investments in Recreation

Indicator Linkage to Objectives:

B. Community forests provide social benefits to their communities and to the province; they

promote community involvement and participation and forest worker safety.

Rationale

One of the most significant benefits for many communities that have community forests are the investments the organization makes in creating, improving and maintaining recreational infrastructure

and opportunities. This indicator will measure the value of the cash and in-kind investments in recreation that the community forest has made in the reporting year and over time.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

1. The estimated cash and in-kind investments in recreation features by type.

2. The total number of kilometres of trail the community forest, or its partner community

organizations, have built or maintained.

3. The total number of kilometres of trail the community forest, or its partner community

organizations, have built or maintained over time.

Instructions

Respondents estimate cash & in-kind investments in recreation features. Respondents to estimate the total number of kilometres of trail the community forest has built or maintained both in the reporting

year and over time. This can include work done by recreation groups that partner with the community

forest organization.

Respondents can include investments & trails outside the boundaries of the community forest.

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported.

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Measurement Interval: Annual

Indicator #13: Proactive Management of Wildfire Hazard

Indicator Linkage to Objectives:

- A. Community forests provide economic benefits to their communities and to British Columbia.
- B. Community forests provide social benefits to their communities and to the province; they promote community involvement and participation and forest worker safety.
- D. Community forest management is consistent with sound principles of environmental stewardship that reflect a broad spectrum of values.

Rationale

The combined effects of climate change, the mountain pine beetle, past management increasing forest fuels and the province's limited fire suppression capacity are leading to an increase in wildfire incidence and severity. Community forests are situated in the interface between communities and wild forest lands, and are uniquely positioned to serve as leaders in the coordination and management of these areas to reduce the risk of catastrophic wildfire. Efforts to manage the wildfire hazard to communities are primarily driven by social objectives, however depending on the ecosystem type, history and outcome of the treatments; they may also bring economic and environmental benefits.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

- 1. The value of investments, cash and in-kind made by the community forest to reduce wildfire hazard.
- 2. The number of hectares treated.

Instructions

You will report separately on the total dollars invested, which includes the community forest's own funds as well as funds from outside sources. Tally the amount for the fiscal year and for the amount invested to date.

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported.

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Indicator #14: Forest Worker Safety

Indicator Linkage to Objectives:

B. Community forests provide social benefits to their communities and to the province; they

promote community involvement and participation and forest worker safety.

Rationale

One of the provincial government's objectives for the community forest program is to advocate forest

worker safety.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

1. Whether or not the CFA holder requires its employees and/or contractors to be Safe

Certified with the BC Forest Safety Council or an equivalent program.

2. The number of recordable incidents.

3. The number of recorded incidents that prevented a worker from returning to work.

Instructions

1. Does the CFA holder require its employees and/or contractors to be Safe Certified with the

BC Forest Safety Council or an equivalent program? Yes/No

2. The number of recordable incidents. This is the number of incidents requiring a visit to a

3. The number of recorded incidents that prevented a worker from returning to work.

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported.

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Measurement Interval: Annual

C. Community forests promote communication and strengthen relationships between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal communities and persons.

Rationale

The BC Community Forest Association promotes forest management which respects First Nation rights and cultural values, and which fosters understanding and cooperation between rural communities and First Nations. Many community forest agreements are held by First Nations, and even more are partnerships between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal communities. This indicator will measure the breadth and depth of First Nations involvement in the community forest. It will serve to demonstrate how effective community forest organizations are at working with the First Nation within whose territory the community forest is located.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

1. The types of involvement with First Nations, beyond legal requirements.

Instructions

Respondents will be given a list of types of involvement with First Nations. These will include:

- The community forest is held by a First Nation
- The governance structure is a partnership with local First Nation(s)
- There is designated First Nations representation on the board
- Employment contracts with First Nations
- Cooperative planning
- Memoranda of Understanding
- Capacity building activities such as training and education.

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported.

Indicator Monitoring Plan

D. Community forest management is consistent with sound principles of environmental stewardship that reflect a broad spectrum of values.

Rationale

Community forests, by their design, must integrate the values of the communities that manage them. This unique model of forest management sees CFA managers gaining the social license to operate in highly constrained areas that have not been previously accessible due to local values. And, while taking all that into consideration, they also comply with the tenure regulations and Acts of British Columbia.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

- 1. The total number of hectares in the Community Forest Agreement area.
- 2. The number of hectares within the community forest that are considered sensitive.
- 3. The number of hectares within the community forest that are considered sensitive and operable.
- 4. The number of hectares of sensitive areas within the community forest that have been treated prior to the reporting period if one has been conducted.
- 5. In the reporting period, the number of hectares of operations that contained sensitive zones.

Instructions

Respondents to use Vegetation Resources Inventory (VRI) data or better. Questions are designed to differentiate the areas where no forestry can occur from areas where modified management practices can occur.

Sensitive areas are defined as: domestic and community watersheds; riparian areas; visually sensitive areas ('preservation', 'retention', and 'partial retention' VQO's--not 'modification' VQO); 'potentially unstable' and 'unstable' terrain (Terrain Class IV and V); areas with archaeological values or cultural heritage (e.g., per Archaeological Overview Assessments); identified/critical wildlife habitat (e.g. ungulate winter range, wildlife habitat areas, caribou habitat, anything covered by a GAR order); fisheries sensitive watersheds; (buffers on) recreation trails and sites; areas identified as sensitive by the community.

Questions 1-4. Likely to be a onetime measure, updated periodically if there is new information

Question 2. Will be updated annually.

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported.

Indicator Monitoring Plan

B. Community forests provide social benefits to their communities and to the province; they promote community involvement and participation and forest worker safety.

D. Community forest management is consistent with sound principles of environmental stewardship that reflect a broad spectrum of values.

Rationale

This indicator will demonstrate the investments the community forest is making in enhanced forest stewardship, incremental to legal requirements.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

- 1. The value, in dollars, of investments made by the community forest in enhanced or modified management for ecological or social reasons within the community forest and outside the boundaries
- 2. The number of hectares treated within the community forest and outside the boundaries

Instructions

The survey will provide a list of possible activities incremental to legal requirements. This includes:

- Enhanced management of sensitive areas (as listed in Indicator 16)
- Information gathering & planning, monitoring and research. Including inventory and extra surveys that are incremental to legal requirements.

Respondents to answer separately the questions above for investments made and hectares treated within the Community Forest Agreement area and also outside.

It is understood that there will be overlap (i.e. some areas are sensitive for multiple reasons).

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported.

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Indicator #18: Compliance with Environmental Standards

Indicator Linkage to Objectives:

D. Community forest management is consistent with sound principles of environmental

stewardship that reflect a broad spectrum of values.

Rationale

This indicator shows that the management of the community forest is in compliance with statutory

requirements for resource management.

Methodology

Survey respondents will report:

1. The number of FLNRO C&E inspections conducted, as well as the number of determinations

issued against the community forest organization/contractors/employees.

2. The results of a Forest Practices Board audit, if one has been conducted.

3. The results of other agency investigations, if applicable (DFO is one example, ABCFP is

another example)

Instructions

1. Respondents will request a compliance report from their District's Compliance and

Enforcement staff on their license.

2. Use this report to report on the number of non-compliance actions that were issued.

3. Respondents will report on the results of Forest Practices Board audits.

Calculations & Analysis

The BCCFA will tally the results and derive the figures to be reported.

Indicator Monitoring Plan

Measurement Interval: Annual

We extend our sincere gratitude to those who have volunteered their time to the project to date:

Community Forest Indicators Project Advisory Group

- 1. Lisa Ambus, Advisor, Wetzin'kwa Community Forest
- 2. George Brcko, BCCFA Director, Wells Gray Community Forest
- 3. Don Brown, BCCFA President, Logan Lake Community Forest Corporation
- 4. Gary Bull, Professor, UBC Faculty of Forestry
- 5. Gord Chipman, BCCFA Treasurer, Esk'etemc Community Forest
- 6. Ken Day, UBC, Alex Fraser Research Forest
- 7. Mile Djukic, Tenures Forester (Kamloops), MFLNRO
- 8. Mike Francis, BCCFA Member, Lower North Thomson Community Forest
- 9. Peter Graff, Senior Timber Tenures Forester, MFLNRO
- 10. Jennifer Gunter, BCCFA Executive Director
- 11. Andrea Inwards, Tenures Forester (Kamloops), MFLNRO
- 12. Barb Jackson, Advisor
- 13. Geoff Klassen, Timber Tenures Forester, MFLNRO
- 14. Jim Langridge, Advisor
- 15. Dave Lasser, BCCFA Director, Sunshine Coast Community Forest
- 16. Erik Leslie, BCCFA Secretary, Harrop-Procter Community Forest
- 17. Casey Macaulay, Advisor
- 18. Jack McLeman, BCCFA Vice President, Alberni Valley Community Forest
- 19. Susan Mulkey, BCCFA Manager, Communications and Extension
- 20. Chris Ortner, Advisor
- 21. John Stace-Smith, BCCFA Director, Likely Xats'ull Community Forest
- 22. Doug Stewart, Director of Forest Tenures Branch, MFLNRO
- 23. Dwight Scott Wolfe, Advisor
- 24. Harley Wright, BCCFA Member, Lower North Thomson Community Forest